

## Editor's Response to Comments on the Paper: Kinetics Studies on Oxirane Cleavage of Epoxidized Soybean Oil by Methanol and Characterization of Polyols

Richard W. Hartel

Received: 19 September 2008 / Accepted: 19 September 2008 / Published online: 29 October 2008  
© AOCS 2008

In our February 2008 issue, we published the paper "Kinetic Studies on Oxirane Cleavage of Epoxidized Soybean Oil by Methanol and Characterization of Polyols" by Bo Lin, Liting Yang, Honghai Dai, and Aihua Yi in the *Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society* (2008) 85:113–117 (doi:10.1007/s11746-007-1187-5). Consequently, we received a Letter to the Editor from Dr. Zoran Petrovic and Yijin Xu addressing concerns about the results in this article. Petrovic and Xu went so far as to conduct additional experiments in an attempt to verify the results of the original work, but were unsuccessful. In response, the authors also conducted additional experiments and came to the same conclusions as Petrovic and Xu. Published below is the critique of Petrovic and Xu as well as the authors' response so that our readers can evaluate the science for themselves.

Based on the additional data, we at *JAOCs* conclude that the results would not have justified publication of the original paper. We at *JAOCs* express our appreciation to Dr. Petrovic and Yijin Xu for bringing their criticisms forward and to the authors for acknowledging their error. The quality of *JAOCs* and, more appropriately all peer-reviewed scientific publications, relies on the collective responsibility and contributions of authors, readers, reviewers and editors alike. This process works well in the great majority of cases; it is unfortunate, however, that in this case, an error such as this was allowed to pass through.

We apologize for any inconvenience this may have caused our readers.

Richard W. Hartel  
Editor in Chief, *JAOCs*

---

R. W. Hartel (✉)  
Department of Food Science, University of Wisconsin,  
Madison, USA  
e-mail: rwhartel@wisc.edu